# SENATE, No. 477 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 215th LEGISLATURE

PRE-FILED FOR INTRODUCTION IN THE 2012 SESSION

Sponsored by: Senator SAMUEL D. THOMPSON District 12 (Burlington, Middlesex, Monmouth and Ocean)

#### SYNOPSIS

Concerns medical malpractice procedures and liability.

#### **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

Introduced Pending Technical Review by Legislative Counsel



2

AN ACT concerning medical malpractice and revising parts of the
 statutory law.

3

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State
of New Jersey:

6 7

1. (New section) As used in this act:

8 "Health care provider" means any person licensed in this State to 9 practice medicine and surgery, chiropractic, podiatry, dentistry, 10 optometry, psychology, pharmacy, nursing, physical therapy or as a 11 bioanalytical laboratory director, or a hospital or other health care 12 facility.

"Medical malpractice" means a negligent act or omission to act by a health care provider in the rendering of professional services, which act or omission is the proximate cause of a personal injury or wrongful death, provided that such services are within the scope of services for which the health care provider is licensed and which are not within any restriction imposed by the licensing board or licensed hospital.

20

21 2. (New section) a. A person shall not commence an action 22 alleging medical malpractice against a health care provider, unless 23 the person has given the health care provider written notice of that proposed action not less than 180 days before the action is filed. 24 25 The notice of intent to file an action shall be mailed to the last 26 known professional business address or residential address of the 27 health care provider who is the subject of the claim. Proof of the mailing of the notice required pursuant to this subsection shall be 28 29 prima facie evidence of compliance. If no professional business or 30 residential address is known, notice may be mailed to the health 31 care facility where the care that is the subject of the action was 32 rendered.

33 b. Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection a. of this 34 section, there shall be a 90-day notice period in any case in which 35 (1) the claimant has previously filed the 180-day notice required in 36 subsection a. against other health care providers; (2) the claimant 37 has filed a complaint and commenced an action alleging medical 38 malpractice against one or more of the health care providers in 39 connection with the same claim; or (3) the claimant did not identify, 40 and could not reasonably have identified, a health care provider to 41 which notice is required to be sent pursuant to subsection a. of this 42 section, as a potential party to the complaint.

c. After the initial notice is given to a health care provider under
subsection a. of this section, no addition of any successive 180-day
periods shall be permitted, notwithstanding the number of

EXPLANATION – Matter enclosed in **bold-faced** brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and is intended to be omitted in the law.

Matter underlined <u>thus</u> is new matter.

3

additional notices that may be filed in connection with the claim or 1 2 the number of health care providers that may be notified. 3 4 3. (New section) Every notice given to a health care provider 5 pursuant to section 2 of this act shall contain a statement of at least 6 all of the following: 7 a. The factual basis for the claim; 8 b. The applicable standard of practice or care alleged by the 9 claimant; 10 c. The manner in which it is claimed that the applicable standard 11 of practice or care was breached by the health care provider; 12 d. The alleged action that should have been taken to achieve 13 compliance with the alleged standard of practice or care; 14 The manner in which it is alleged that the breach of the e. 15 standard of practice or care was the proximate cause of the injury 16 that is the subject of the proposed action; and 17 f. The names of all health care providers that the claimant is 18 notifying pursuant to section 2 of this act in connection with the 19 alleged action. 20 21 4. (New section) a. Not later than 60 days after giving notice 22 pursuant to section 2 of this act, the claimant shall allow the health 23 care provider receiving the notice access to all of the medical records related to the claim that are in the claimant's control, and 24 25 shall provide releases for any medical records related to the claim 26 that are not in the claimant's control, but of which the claimant has 27 knowledge. b. Not later than 60 days after giving notice pursuant to 28 29 subsection a. of this section, the health care provider shall allow the 30 claimant access to all medical records in its possession that are 31 related to the claim, provided that this shall not restrict a health care 32 provider that receives notice of a claim from communicating with 33 other health care providers and acquiring medical records as may be 34 necessary or pertinent to the claim. 35 36 5. (New section) a. A person who has given notice pursuant to 37 section 2 of this act or who has commenced an action alleging medical malpractice shall be deemed to have waived, for the 38 39 purposes of that claim or action, any right of confidentiality with 40 respect to any medical records relating to the claim or action as well 41 as any other similar privilege established in law with respect to any 42 person or entity who was involved in the acts, transactions, events, 43 or occurrences that are the basis for the claim or action or who provided care or treatment to the claimant or plaintiff for the 44 45 condition that is the subject of the claim or action or a condition 46 related to the claim or action either before or after those acts, 47 transactions, events, or occurrences, whether or not the person is a 48 party to the claim or action.

4

b. Pursuant to subsection a. of this section, a person or entity: 1 2 (1) who has received notice pursuant to section 2 of this act; or (2) 3 who has been named as a defendant in an action alleging medical 4 malpractice, or that person's or entity's attorney or authorized 5 representative, may communicate with a health care provider, or 6 any business entity of which the foregoing are a part, or any 7 employee or agent thereof, in order to obtain all information 8 relevant to the subject matter of the claim or action and to prepare 9 the person's or entity's defense to the claim or action. 10 c. Any person who discloses or releases information pursuant to 11 subsection b. of this section to a person who has received notice 12 under section 2 of this act or to a person or entity who has been 13 named as a defendant in an action alleging medical malpractice or 14 to the person or entity's attorney or other authorized representative 15 shall not be deemed to have violated any law regarding the privacy 16 or confidentiality of records or any other similar duty or obligation 17 to the claimant or plaintiff otherwise provided by law. 18 19 6. (New section) Not later than 120 days after receipt of the 20 notice required pursuant to section 2 of this act, the health care 21 provider against whom the claim is made shall furnish to the 22 claimant or his authorized representative a written response that 23 contains a statement of the following: 24 a. The factual basis for the defense of the claim; 25 b. The standard of practice or care that the health care provider 26 claims to be applicable to the proposed action, and that the health 27 care provider that is the subject of the claim complied with that 28 standard; 29 c. The manner in which it is claimed by the health care provider 30 that there was compliance with the applicable standard of practice 31 or care: 32 d. The manner in which the health care provider contends that 33 the alleged negligence was not the proximate cause of the claimant's 34 alleged injury or damage. 35 36 7. (New section) a. If at any time during the applicable notice 37 period or periods provided in sections 2, 4 and 6 of this act, a health care provider receiving notice informs the claimant in writing that it 38 39 does not intend to settle the claim within the applicable notice 40 period, the claimant may file an action alleging medical malpractice 41 against the health care provider, as long as the claim is not barred 42 by the applicable statute of limitations for the filing of such claims. 43 b. If a claimant does not receive the written response required 44 pursuant to section 6 of this act within the required 120-day time 45 period, the claimant may file an action alleging medical malpractice 46 upon the expiration of that period. 47 48 8. (New section) a. Subject to the provisions of subsection b. of

this section, in an action alleging medical malpractice, the plaintiff 1 2 shall have the burden of proving that in light of the state of the art 3 existing at the time of the alleged malpractice: (1) the defendant, if 4 a general practitioner, failed to provide the plaintiff with the 5 recognized standard of acceptable professional practice or care in 6 the community in which the defendant practices or in a similar 7 community, and that as a proximate result of the defendant failing 8 to provide that standard, the plaintiff suffered an injury; or (2) the 9 defendant, if a specialist, failed to provide the plaintiff with the 10 recognized standard of practice or care within that specialty as 11 reasonably applied in light of the facilities available in the 12 community or other facilities reasonably available in the community 13 or other facilities reasonably available under the circumstances, and 14 as a proximate result of the defendant failing to provide that 15 standard, the plaintiff suffered an injury.

b. In any action alleging medical malpractice, the plaintiff shall
have the burden of proving that he suffered an injury that more
probably than not was proximately caused by the negligence of the
defendant or defendants.

c. In any action alleging medical malpractice, a plaintiff shall
not recover for loss of an opportunity to survive or an opportunity
to achieve a better result unless the opportunity is determined to be
greater than 50%.

24

25 9. (New section) a. In any action alleging medical malpractice, 26 the plaintiff shall file an affidavit pursuant to the provisions of 27 P.L.1995, c.139 (C.2A:53A-26 et seq.); provided, however, that notwithstanding the provisions of that law to the contrary, the 28 29 affidavit shall be filed by the plaintiff at the time of the filing of the 30 complaint and the affidavit shall be submitted by a person who the 31 plaintiff's attorney reasonably believes meets the requirements of an 32 expert witness as set forth in section 10 of this act.

33 b. Within 21 days following the filing of an affidavit by the 34 plaintiff in accordance with subsection a. of this section, the defendant shall file an answer. In addition, not later than 90 days 35 36 following the filing of the affidavit, the defendant shall file an 37 affidavit of meritorious defense signed by a person whom the 38 defendant's attorney reasonably believes meets the qualifications for 39 an expert witness as set forth in section 10 of this act. The affidavit 40 of meritorious defense shall certify that the person providing the 41 affidavit has reviewed the complaint and all medical records 42 supplied to him by the defendant's attorney concerning the 43 allegations contained in the complaint and shall contain a statement 44 of each of the following:

45 (1) The factual basis for each defense to the claims made against46 the defendant in the complaint;

47 (2) The standard of practice or care that the health care provider48 named as a defendant in the complaint claims to be applicable to the

6

1 action and that the defendant complied with that standard;

2 (3) The manner in which it is claimed by the defendant that
3 there was compliance with the applicable standard of practice or
4 care;

5 (4) The manner in which the defendant contends that the alleged 6 injury or damage to the plaintiff is not related to the care and 7 treatment rendered.

8 c. If the plaintiff in an action alleging medical malpractice fails 9 to allow access to medical records as required pursuant to section 4 10 of this act, the affidavit of meritorious defense required pursuant to 11 subsection b. of this section may be filed not later than 90 days after 12 filing an answer to the complaint.

13

14 10. (New section) a. In an action alleging medical malpractice, 15 a person shall not give expert testimony or execute an affidavit 16 pursuant to section 9 of this act on the appropriate standard of 17 practice or care unless the person is licensed as a physician or other 18 health care professional licensed in this State and meets the 19 following criteria:

20 (1) If the party against whom or on whose behalf the testimony 21 is offered is a specialist, the person providing the testimony shall 22 have specialized at the time of the occurrence that is the basis for 23 the action in the same specialty as the party against whom or on 24 whose behalf the testimony is offered, and if the person against 25 whom or on whose behalf the testimony is being offered is board 26 certified, the expert witness shall be a specialist who is board 27 certified in the same specialty, and during the year immediately preceding the date of the occurrence that is the basis for the claim 28 29 or action, shall have devoted a majority of his or her professional 30 time to either: (a) the active clinical practice of the same health 31 care profession in which the defendant is licensed, and if the 32 defendant is a specialist, the active clinical practice of that 33 specialty; or (b) the instruction of students in an accredited medical 34 school, other accredited health professional school or accredited 35 residency or clinical research program in the same health profession 36 in which the defendant is licensed, and, if that party is a specialist, 37 an accredited medical school, health professional school or accredited residency or clinical research program in the same 38 39 specialty; or (c) both.

40 (2) If the party against whom or on whose behalf the testimony 41 is offered is a general practitioner, the expert witness, during the 42 year immediately preceding the date of the occurrence that is the 43 basis for the claim or action shall have devoted a majority of his or 44 her professional time to: (a) active clinical practice as a general 45 practitioner; or (b) the instruction of students in an accredited 46 medical school, health professional school, or accredited residency 47 or clinical research program in the same health care profession in 48 which the party against whom or on whose behalf the testimony is

1 licensed; or (c) both. 2 b. In determining the qualifications of an expert witness in an 3 action alleging medical malpractice, the court shall, at a minimum, 4 evaluate all of the following: (1) the educational and professional training of the expert witness; (2) the area of specialization of the 5 6 expert witness; (3) the length of time the expert witness has been 7 engaged in the active clinical practice or instruction of the health 8 care profession or specialty; and (4) the relevancy of the expert 9 witness's testimony. 10 c. Nothing in this section shall limit the power of the trial court to disqualify an expert witness on grounds other than the 11 12 qualifications set forth in this section. 13 In an action alleging medical malpractice, the following d. 14 limitations shall apply to discovery conducted by opposing counsel 15 to determine whether or not an expert witness is qualified: (1) tax 16 returns of an expert witness are not discoverable; (2) family 17 members of an expert witness shall not be deposed concerning the 18 amount of time the expert witness spends engaged in the practice of 19 his or her profession; and (3) a personal diary or calendar belonging 20 to an expert witness is not discoverable. For the purposes of this 21 paragraph (3), "personal diary or calendar" means a diary or 22 calendar that does not include listings or records of professional 23 activities. 24 e. In an action alleging medical malpractice, an expert witness 25 shall not testify on a contingency fee basis. A person who violates 26 this subsection is guilty of a crime of the fourth degree. 27 28 11. (New section) a. In an action alleging medical malpractice, 29 a scientific opinion rendered by an otherwise qualified expert is not 30 admissible unless the court determines that the opinion is reliable 31 and will assist the trier of fact. In making that determination, the 32 court shall examine the opinion and the basis for the opinion, which 33 basis shall include the facts, technique, methodology, and reasoning 34 relied up on by the expert, and shall consider all of the following 35 factors: 36 (1) Whether the opinion and its basis have been subjected to 37 scientific testing and replication; (2) Whether the opinion and its basis have been subjected to 38 39 peer review publication; 40 (3) The existence and maintenance of generally accepted 41 standards governing the application and interpretation of a 42 methodology or technique and whether the opinion and its basis are 43 consistent with those standards; 44 (4) The known or potential error rate of the opinion and its 45 basis; 46 (5) The degree to which the opinion and its basis are generally 47 accepted within the relevant expert community. As used in this 48 paragraph (5), "relevant expert community" means individuals who

#### 8

are knowledgeable in the field of study and are gainfully employed
 applying that knowledge on the free market;

3 (6) Whether the basis for the opinion is reliable and whether
4 experts in that field would rely on the same basis to reach the type
5 of opinion being proffered;

6 (7) Whether the opinion or methodology is relied upon by7 experts outside of the context of litigation.

b. A novel methodology or form of scientific evidence may be
admitted into evidence only if its proponent establishes that it has
achieved general scientific acceptance among impartial and
disinterested experts in the field.

c. In an action alleging medical malpractice, the provisions of
this section are in addition to, and do not otherwise affect, the
criteria for expert testimony provided for in section 10 of this act.

15

16 12. (New section) a. In an action alleging medical malpractice, 17 a party named as a defendant in the action may, instead of 18 answering or otherwise pleading, file with the court an affidavit 19 certifying that he was not involved, either directly or indirectly, in 20 the occurrence alleged in the action. Unless the affidavit is opposed 21 pursuant to subsection b. of this section, the court shall order the 22 dismissal of the claim, without prejudice, against the party 23 providing that certification.

24 b. Any party to a medical malpractice action may oppose the 25 dismissal of any claim pursuant to the filing of an affidavit in 26 accordance with subsection a. of this section or may move to vacate 27 an order of dismissal and the court may reinstate as a party the person filing the affidavit if it can be shown that the party was 28 29 involved in the occurrence alleged in the action. Reinstatement of a 30 party pursuant to this subsection shall not be barred by any statute 31 of limitations defense that was not valid at the time the original 32 action was filed. The person opposing the dismissal of the claim 33 pursuant to this subsection shall have standing to obtain discovery 34 regarding the involvement or noninvolvement of the party filing the 35 affidavit, which discovery shall be completed within 90 days after 36 the affidavit is filed.

37

13. (New section) a. An action alleging medical malpractice
shall be mediated pursuant to this act. The judge to whom an action
alleging medical malpractice is assigned shall refer the action to
mediation by written order not less than 90 days after the filing of
the answer or answers required by sections 6 and 9 of this act.

b. An action referred to mediation pursuant to subsection a. of
this section shall be heard by a panel of neutral mediators. A
person serving as a neutral mediator shall comply with ethics
standards established by the Supreme Court governing conflicts of
interest, professional relationships, and such other issues as the
Court may establish. A proposed neutral mediator shall be

disqualified from service in any case in which a judge determines that the ethics standards established by the Court would preclude his service on the case, and a neutral mediator may disqualify himself if he determines an affiliation with any party to the dispute that would preclude his service under the ethics standards.

6 c. In any mediation required pursuant to subsection a. of this 7 section, a panel of neutral mediators shall be selected in a manner 8 determined by the court. Each panel shall be composed of five 9 voting members, two of whom shall be attorneys admitted in this 10 State, and two of whom shall be licensed health care providers 11 licensed under the same licensing board as the defendant. If a 12 defendant is a specialist, the health care providers on the panel shall 13 specialize in the same, or related, relevant area of health care as the 14 defendant. The fifth member shall be selected from a pool of active 15 or retired Superior Court judges, active or retired administrative law 16 judges, active or retired workers compensation judges, or other 17 individuals as the Court may determine appropriate to qualify as 18 neutral mediators. An active judge of the Superior Court may be 19 selected as a member of a mediation panel but may not preside at 20 the trial of any action in which he served as mediator. The grounds 21 for disqualification of a neutral mediator in an action shall be the 22 same as the grounds for the disqualification of a judge from an 23 action.

24

25 14. (New section) a. The judge to whom the medical 26 malpractice action has been assigned shall designate a person, who 27 may be the clerk of the court, the assignment clerk, or another person, to serve as the mediation clerk. The mediation clerk shall 28 29 set a time and place for the mediation hearing and send notice to the 30 neutral mediators and the attorneys of record in the case at least 30 31 days before the date set for the mediation hearing. Adjournments of 32 mediation hearings shall be granted only for good cause, in 33 accordance with the Rules Governing the Courts of the State of 34 New Jersey.

b. Not later than the 14 days following the mailing of the notice of the mediation hearing pursuant to subsection a. of this section, each party to the mediation shall pay a fee as prescribed by the court. If a claim is derivative of another claim, the claims shall be treated as a single claim, with one fee paid and a single award made by the neutral mediators.

41 c. Not later than seven days before the mediation hearing date, 42 each party shall submit to the mediation clerk five copies of the 43 documents relating to the issues to be mediated and five copies of a 44 concise brief or summary that sets forth that party's factual or legal 45 position on issues presented in the malpractice action. In addition, 46 one copy of each shall be provided to each attorney of record in the 47 case. Failure to submit the materials required by this subsection 48 shall result in a fine to be determined by the judge to whom the

1 medical malpractice action has been assigned.

2

3 15. (New section) a. A party to the case has the right, but is not 4 required, to attend a mediation hearing. If scars, disfigurement or 5 other pertinent conditions exist, they may be demonstrated to the 6 mediation panel by a personal appearance of the party alleging 7 malpractice, but testimony shall not be taken or permitted from any 8 such party. The Rules of Evidence shall not apply in proceedings of 9 the mediation panel but factual information having a bearing on 10 damages or liability shall be supported by documentary evidence if 11 possible or practicable.

12 b. Oral presentation shall be limited to fifteen minutes per side 13 unless multiple parties or unusual circumstances warrant additional 14 time, which may be granted by the mediation panel. The panel may 15 request information on applicable insurance policy limits and may 16 inquire about settlement negotiations unless objected to by any 17 party. Statements by the attorneys during the hearing and the briefs 18 or summaries presented pursuant to subsection c. of section 14 of 19 this act shall not be admissible in any subsequent court or 20 evidentiary hearing.

21

22 16. (New section) a. Except as otherwise provided in subsection 23 b. of this section, not later than 14 days after the mediation hearing, 24 the panel shall make an evaluation and notify the attorney for each 25 party of its evaluation in writing. The evaluation shall include a 26 specific finding on the standard of care provided. The mediation panel shall indicate in the evaluation if a determination or award of 27 28 the panel is not unanimous.

29 If the mediation panel unanimously determines that a b. 30 complete action or defense is frivolous as to any party, the panel 31 shall state this to that party. If the action proceeds to trial, the party 32 who has been determined to have a frivolous action or defense shall 33 post a cash or surety bond, approved by the court, in the amount of 34 \$10,000 for each party against whom the action or defense was 35 determined to be frivolous. If judgment is entered against the party 36 who posted the bond, the bond shall be used to pay all reasonable 37 costs incurred by the other party or parties in the frivolous action, as 38 well as any costs allowed by law or by court rule, including court 39 costs and reasonable attorneys' fees.

40 c. The evaluation of the mediation panel shall include a 41 separate determination or award as to each cross-claim, 42 counterclaim, or third-party claim that has been filed in the action.

43

44 17. (New section) a. Each party shall file a written acceptance 45 or rejection of the mediation panel's evaluation with the mediation 46 clerk not later than 30 days after service of the panel's evaluation. 47 The failure to file a written acceptance or rejection within the time 48 limit prescribed shall constitute acceptance of the evaluation. A

#### 11

party's acceptance or rejection of the panel's evaluation shall not be
 disclosed until the expiration of the time limit prescribed herein, at
 which time the mediation clerk shall send a notice indicating each

4 party's acceptance or rejection of the panel's evaluation.

5 b. With respect to mediation involving multiple parties, the6 following rules shall apply:

(1) Each party shall have the option of accepting all of the
determinations or awards covering the claims by or against that
party or of accepting some and rejecting others; provided, however,
that as to any particular opposing party, the party shall either accept
or reject the evaluation in its entirety;

(2) A party who accepts all of the awards may specifically
indicate that he or she intends the acceptance to be effective only if
all opposing parties accept. If this limitation is not included in the
acceptance, an accepting party shall be considered to have agreed to
entry of judgment as to that party and those of the opposing parties
who accept, with the action to continue between the accepting party
and those opposing parties who reject;

(3) If a party makes a limited acceptance under paragraph (2) of
this subsection and some of the opposing parties accept and others
reject the evaluation, for the purposes of the cost provisions
contained in section 18 of this act, the party who made the limited
acceptance shall be considered to have rejected as to those opposing
parties who accepted.

25

26 18. (New section) a. If all of the parties accept the mediation 27 panel's evaluation, judgment shall be entered in that amount, which shall include all fees costs and interest to the date of judgment. In a 28 29 case involving multiple parties, judgment shall be entered as to 30 those opposing parties who have accepted the portions of the panel's 31 evaluation that apply to them. Except as otherwise provided in this 32 act with respect to cases involving multiple parties, if all or part of 33 the evaluation of the mediation panel is rejected, the action shall 34 proceed to trial.

b. The mediation clerk shall place a copy of the mediation evaluation and the parties' respective acceptances and rejections in a sealed envelope for filing with the clerk of the court. In a nonjury action, the envelope shall not be opened and the parties shall not reveal the amount of the evaluation until the judge has rendered judgment.

41 c. If a party has rejected an evaluation and the action proceeds to 42 trial, that party shall pay the opposing party's actual costs unless the 43 verdict is more favorable to the rejecting party than the mediation 44 evaluation; provided, however, that if the opposing party has also 45 rejected the evaluation, that party is entitled to costs only if the 46 verdict is more favorable to that party than the mediation 47 evaluation. For the purposes of this subsection, a verdict shall be 48 adjusted by adding to it assessable costs and interest on the amount

of the verdict from the filing of the complaint to the date of the 1 2 mediation evaluation. Following this adjustment, the verdict shall 3 be considered more favorable to a defendant if it is more than 10% 4 below the evaluation, and is considered more favorable to the 5 plaintiff if it is more than 10% above the evaluation. The judge 6 shall determine the costs pursuant to this subsection, including 7 reasonable fees for attorney services necessitated by the rejection of 8 the mediation panel's evaluation. No costs shall be awarded if the 9 mediation determination or award was not unanimous.

10

19. (New section) a. In any action for damages alleging medical 11 12 malpractice by or against a health care provider, the total amount of damages for noneconomic loss recoverable by all plaintiffs, 13 14 resulting from negligence of all defendants, shall not exceed 15 \$250,000, unless, as the result of the negligence of one or more of 16 the defendants, one or more of the following exceptions exist, in 17 which case damages for noneconomic loss shall not exceed 18 \$500,000: (1) the plaintiff is hemiplegic, paraplegic, or quadriplegic 19 resulting in a total permanent functional loss of one or more limbs 20 caused by injury to the brain or injury to the spinal cord, or both; 21 (2) the plaintiff has permanently impaired cognitive capacity 22 rendering him incapable of making independent, responsible life 23 decisions and permanently incapable of independently performing 24 the activities of normal, daily living; or (3) there has been 25 permanent loss of or damage to a reproductive organ resulting in the 26 inability to procreate.

b. In awarding damages in an action alleging medical
malpractice, the trier of fact shall itemize damages into damages for
economic loss and damages for noneconomic loss.

c. The Supreme Court shall adjust the limitation annually on
damages for noneconomic loss provided for in subsection a. of this
section by an amount determined by the Court to reflect the
cumulative annual percentage change in the Consumer Price Index
for All Urban Consumers issued by the United States Department of
Labor.

36

20. (New section) a. A judge presiding over an action alleging medical malpractice shall review each verdict to determine if the judgment or settlement is in accordance with the provisions of section 19 of this act. If the verdict exceeds the limitations on noneconomic loss set forth in that section, the court shall set aside any amount of noneconomic damages in excess of the amounts provided therein.

b. A judge presiding over an action alleging medical malpractice
shall review each verdict and shall: (1) concur with the award; (2)
upon motion by any party, within 21 days of entry of the judgment
of the court, grant a new trial to all or some of the parties, on all or
some issues, whenever their substantial rights are materially

1 affected because: (a) the judge determines a verdict to be clearly 2 inadequate or excessive; (b) the judge determines excessive or 3 inadequate damages to have been influenced by passion or 4 prejudice; (c) the judge determines a verdict to have been against 5 the great weight of the evidence or contrary to law; (d) the judge 6 determines that there is newly discovered material evidence which 7 with reasonable diligence could not have been discovered and 8 produced at trial; or (e) the judge makes any other determination 9 otherwise provided by law or court rule.

c. Within 21 days after entry of a judgment, the court on its own
initiative may order a new trial for any of the reasons set forth in
subsection b. of this section, which order shall specify the grounds
upon which the order is based.

14 If the court finds that the only error in the trial is the d. 15 inadequacy or excessiveness of the verdict, the court may grant a new trial unless, within 14 days, the nonmoving party consents in 16 17 writing to the entry of judgment in an amount found by the court to 18 be the lowest or highest amount the evidence will support. If the 19 moving party appeals, the written consent provided for in this 20 subsection shall in no way prejudice the nonmoving party's 21 argument on appeal that the original verdict was correct. If the 22 nonmoving party prevails on appeal, the original verdict may be 23 reinstated by the Appellate Division.

24

25 21. (New section) If the plaintiff in an action alleging medical 26 malpractice enters into a settlement agreement with a defendant 27 concerning the action, whether or not the settlement agreement was entered into under court supervision, and the defendant was a health 28 29 care provider licensed under Title 45 of the Revised Statutes, the 30 plaintiff's attorney and the defendant's attorney or, if the plaintiff 31 and defendant are not represented by attorneys, the plaintiff and 32 defendant, shall jointly file a complete written copy of the 33 settlement agreement with the professional board in the Division of 34 Consumer Affairs in the Department of Law and Public Safety not 35 later than 30 days after the settlement agreement is entered into. 36 Any such information filed with a professional board shall be 37 confidential except for use by the board, and shall not be subject to 38 disclosure under the provisions of P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et 39 seq.).

40

41 22. (New section) a. A health care facility or health care agency 42 shall not discharge or discipline, threaten to discharge or discipline, 43 or otherwise discriminate against an employee regarding the 44 employee's compensation, terms, conditions, location, or privileges 45 of employment, or against the privileges of a person who is not an 46 employee of a facility or agency because the employee, other 47 person, or an individual acting on their behalf: (1) reports in good 48 faith or intends to report, verbally or in writing, the medical

14

malpractice of a health care provider; or (2) acts as an expert
 witness in a civil or administrative action involving medical
 malpractice.

b. A health care facility or health care agency that violates the
provisions of subsection a. of this section shall be subject to a fine
of not less than \$5,000 nor more than \$10,000 for each violation.

8 23. (New section) a. For the purposes of this section:

9 "Annuity" means an annuity issued by an insurer licensed or
10 authorized to do business in this State which is a qualified
11 assignment under section 130 of the Internal Revenue Code, 26
12 U.S.C. s. 130;

13 "Future damages" means damages for economic and 14 noneconomic loss which may arise or be incurred after the date on 15 which a judgment or settlement is entered into in an action involving medical malpractice, which shall include future medical 16 17 treatment, care or custody, loss of earnings, loss of bodily function, 18 or damages for noneconomic loss "Judgment creditor" means a plaintiff who is the recipient of an award for economic or 19 20 noneconomic loss that is as the result of an action filed against a 21 health care provider for medical malpractice, which award is 22 subject to the provisions of subsection b. of this section;

"Judgment debtor" means a health care provider who, as a
defendant in an action brought for medical malpractice, is required
to pay the plaintiff an award that is subject to the provisions of
subsection a. of this section;

27 "Plaintiff" means a person bringing an action against a health28 care provider for medical malpractice;

29 "Structured settlement" means an agreement made to settle a 30 claim or lawsuit or respond to a judgment in a lawsuit brought for 31 medical malpractice by an injured person whereby a series of 32 periodic payments rather than a lump sum payment are made over 33 time to a plaintiff, in accordance with the needs of the plaintiff or 34 his family, either through the purchase of an annuity or the 35 establishment of a trust fund, or by another means approved by the 36 court.

37 b. In any judgment or settlement resulting from any medical 38 malpractice action brought by a plaintiff for personal injury or death 39 which is in excess of \$250,000, the court shall enter a judgment 40 ordering that money damages for economic and noneconomic loss, 41 or its equivalent for future damages, shall be paid in the form of a 42 structured settlement by any person, organization, group, or insurer 43 that is contractually liable to pay the judgment or settlement. The 44 sum of \$250,000 as provided herein shall be adjusted annually by 45 the Supreme Court to reflect the cumulative annual percentage 46 change in the Consumer Price Index for All Urban Consumers 47 issued by the United States Department of Labor.

48 c. The structured settlement agreement shall specify the

15

recipient of the payments, the dollar amount of the payments, the
interval between payments, the number of payments or the period of
time over which payments are to be made and the persons to whom
money damages are owed, if any, in the event of the judgment
creditor's death.

6 d. In the event of the judgment creditor's death, the court that 7 rendered the original judgment shall, upon application of any party 8 in interest, modify the judgment to reduce the amount of payments 9 required under the structured settlement agreement by any amounts 10 attributable to the future medical treatment, care or custody, loss of 11 bodily function, or pain and suffering of the deceased judgment 12 creditor. Money damages awarded for loss of future earnings shall 13 not be reduced, nor payments terminated, by reason of the death of 14 the judgment creditor, but shall be paid to persons to whom the 15 judgment creditor owed a duty of support, as provided by law, 16 immediately prior to the judgment creditor's death, or if none, to the 17 judgment creditor's estate.

e. Upon the purchase of an annuity, establishment of a trust, or
approval of another arrangement for periodic payments by a court,
any obligation of the judgment debtor with respect to the judgment
or settlement shall cease.

22

23 24. (New section) a. Every insurer authorized to transact
24 medical malpractice liability insurance in this State shall offer, to
25 groups of 50 or more insureds, group medical malpractice liability
26 insurance policies with a deductible, at the option of the insureds, in
27 amounts of at least \$50,000 per occurrence and up to \$1,000,000
28 per occurrence.

29 b. Physicians, who may be in the same specialty or in different 30 specialties, may purchase such policies jointly, whether or not they 31 are members of the same practice group, and may elect to treat the 32 deductible amount under the policy as a self-insured retention, in 33 which claims filed under the policy are managed by either the 34 insurer issuing the policy, on an administrative-services-only basis, 35 or by an independent third party administrator approved by the 36 commissioner and the insurer issuing the policy.

37 c. A physician group purchasing a policy issued pursuant to the 38 provisions of this section shall do so pursuant to a written 39 agreement, subscribed to by all of the participating physicians. The 40 agreement shall include provisions regarding the selection of an 41 administrator, allocation of contributions to the self-insured 42 retention under the policy, procedures for investment and 43 management of the contributions, allocation of the cost of the 44 policy premium among physician members of the group, and such 45 other matters as to the administration of the program as may be 46 necessary.

47 d. Every insurer authorized to transact medical malpractice48 liability insurance in this State shall offer to individual physicians

16

or practice groups such deductibles on those policies as they may
 require, for a commensurate reduction in premium, which
 deductibles shall be straight deductibles and shall not be treated as
 self-insured retention.

5

6 25. (New section) Notwithstanding any law or regulation to the 7 contrary, no insurer authorized to transact medical malpractice 8 liability insurance shall increase the premium of any medical 9 malpractice liability insurance policy based on a claim of medical 10 negligence or malpractice against the insured unless the claim 11 results in a medical malpractice claim settlement, judgment or 12 arbitration award against the insured.

13

14 26. N.J.S.2A:14-2 is amended to read as follows:

15 2A:14-2. [Every] <u>a. Except as provided in subsection b. of this</u>
16 <u>section, every</u> action at law for an injury to the person caused by the
17 wrongful act, neglect or default of any person within this state shall
18 be commenced within 2 years next after the cause of any such
19 action shall have accrued.

20 b. Every action at law for an injury to the person caused by the 21 professional negligence of a health care provider within this State 22 shall be commenced within three years after the cause of such 23 action shall have accrued or one year after the injured person 24 discovers, or through the use of reasonable diligence should have 25 discovered, the injury, whichever occurs first, except that no such 26 action shall be commenced after three years unless tolled upon proof of fraud, intentional concealment or the presence of a foreign 27 28 body, which has no therapeutic or diagnostic purpose or effect, in 29 the person of the injured person; and except that actions by a minor 30 under the full age of two years shall be commenced within seven 31 years, except that the time limit shall be tolled for these minors for 32 any of the four previous reasons provided in this subsection and for 33 any period during which the parent or guardian and the health care 34 provider's insurer or health care provider have committed fraud or 35 collision in failure to bring an action for professional negligence on 36 behalf of the injured minor. 37 For purposes of this subsection:

37 <u>For purposes of this subsection.</u>
 38 <u>"Health care provider" means any person licensed in this State to</u>
 39 <u>practice medicine and surgery, chiropractic, podiatry, dentistry,</u>
 40 <u>optometry, psychology, pharmacy, nursing, physical therapy or as a</u>

41 bioanalytical laboratory director or hospital or other health care
42 <u>facility.</u>
43 "Professional negligence" means a negligent act or omission to

44 act by a health care provider in the rendering of professional 45 services, which act or omission is the proximate cause of a personal 46 injury or wrongful death, provided that those services are within the 47 scope of services for which the health care provider is licensed and 48 which are not within any restriction imposed by the licensing board

1 <u>or licensed hospital.</u>

2 (cf: N.J.S.2A:14-2)

4 27. This act shall take effect on the 180th day following 5 enactment, and shall apply to any cause of action arising on or after 6 that date.

7

3

8 9

10

#### STATEMENT

This bill establishes procedures for the more expeditious 11 12 discovery and disposition of medical malpractice claims in order to 13 reduce the costs of litigation, and therefore ultimately, the 14 premiums paid by physicians and other health care providers for 15 medical malpractice liability insurance. Further, the bill establishes certain parameters with respect to proof and liability in medical 16 17 malpractice actions, also in the interests of affordability and 18 availability of malpractice insurance.

19 The bill requires a person contemplating commencement of an 20 action alleging malpractice to give the health care provider who is 21 alleged to have been negligent in the rendering of professional 22 services written notice of the proposed action at least 180 days 23 before the action is filed. The notice shall contain the factual basis 24 for the claim, the applicable standard of care and the manner in 25 which that standard was breached and all health care providers that 26 the claimant is notifying. Within 60 days of the initial notice, the 27 claimant must allow the health care providers involved access to all medical records related to the claim and in the claimant's control 28 29 and, likewise, the health care providers must allow the claimant 30 similar access. Not later than 120 days after receipt of the initial 31 notice, the health care provider must respond to the notice stating 32 the basis for the defense of the claim. If at any time during the 33 applicable periods, a health care provider informs the claimant that 34 it does not intend to settle the claim within the notice period, the 35 claimant may immediately file an action alleging medical 36 malpractice, so long as the claim is not otherwise barred by the 37 applicable statute of limitations.

38 "Health care provider" is defined by the bill as any person 39 licensed in this State to practice medicine and surgery, chiropractic, 40 podiatry, dentistry, optometry, psychology, pharmacy, nursing, 41 physical therapy or as a bioanalytical laboratory director, or a 42 hospital or other health care facility or health care agency. 43 "Medical malpractice" is defined as a negligent act or omission to 44 act by a health care provider in the rendering of professional services, which act or omission is the proximate cause of a personal 45 46 injury or wrongful death, provided that such services are within the 47 scope of services for which the health care provider is licensed and 48 which are not within any restriction imposed by the licensing board

1 or licensed hospital.

2 The bill defines the burdens of proof that the plaintiff in a 3 medical malpractice action must meet; specifically that the 4 defendant, if a general practitioner, failed to provide the plaintiff 5 with the recognized standard of acceptable professional practice or 6 care in the community in which the defendant practices or in a 7 similar community, and that as a proximate result of the defendant 8 failing to provide that standard, the plaintiff suffered an injury; or 9 (2) the defendant, if a specialist, failed to provide the plaintiff with 10 the recognized standard of practice within that specialty as 11 reasonably applied in light of the facilities available in the 12 community or other facilities reasonably available in the community 13 or other facilities reasonably available under the circumstances, and 14 as a proximate result of the defendant failing to provide that 15 standard the plaintiff suffered an injury. In any action alleging 16 medical malpractice, the plaintiff shall have the burden of proving 17 that he suffered an injury that more probably than not was 18 proximately caused by the negligence of the defendant. A plaintiff 19 shall not recover for loss of an opportunity to survive or an 20 opportunity to achieve a better result unless the opportunity is 21 determined to be greater than 50%.

22 The bill requires the plaintiff in a medical malpractice action to 23 file an affidavit of merit pursuant to P.L.1995, c.139 (C.2A:53A-26 24 et seq.) at the same time as the filing of the complaint, contrary to 25 the provisions of that law generally. The defendant shall file an 26 answer to the complaint within 21 days of the filing of the 27 complaint and the affidavit of merit and, within 90 days from that filing date, shall file an affidavit of meritorious defense by a person 28 29 who the defense believes meets the qualifications for an expert 30 witness as established by the bill. Essentially, to qualify as an 31 expert or execute an affidavit, the bill requires that the individual be 32 in the same type of practice and possess the same certifications, as 33 applicable, as the defendant. Other requirements for expert and 34 scientific opinions are also spelled out in the bill.

35 Under the bill, all actions alleging malpractice must be mediated 36 by a panel of five neutral mediators, which shall include two 37 attorneys, two health care providers licensed by the same board as 38 the defendant and an active or retired judge, selected in a manner 39 determined by the Supreme Court. Procedures for the mediation of the complaint are enumerated in the bill. A party to the mediation 40 41 is permitted, but not required, to attend. If scars or disfigurement 42 exist, they may be demonstrated, but testimony shall not be taken. 43 The Rules of Evidence will not apply and each side shall be limited 44 to a 15 minute oral presentation. The panel's evaluation of the 45 complaint shall be completed and submitted to the parties in writing 46 within 14 days of the hearing. Each party must file an acceptance 47 or rejection of the evaluation. If all of the parties accept the 48 evaluation, judgment shall be entered in that amount. If any party

rejects the evaluation, the action may proceed to trial. Costs and
 interest are also allocated under the bill according to the outcome of

3 the mediation and evaluation process.

4 Noneconomic damages in medical malpractice actions are 5 limited by the bill to \$250,000, unless, as a result of the 6 malpractice, the plaintiff is hemiplegic, paraplegic, or quadriplegic, 7 the plaintiff has permanently impaired cognitive capacity rendering 8 him incapable of independent daily living, or there has been a 9 permanent loss of or damage to a reproductive organ resulting in the 10 inability to procreate, in which case damages for noneconomic loss 11 shall not exceed \$500,000. The trier of fact must itemize damages into economic and noneconomic loss. The presiding judge must 12 13 review each verdict or settlement and set aside any amount of 14 noneconomic damages in excess of the limits specified by the bill. 15 In cases in which the judgment or settlement exceeds \$250,000, the 16 bill requires structured settlement of money damages for economic 17 and noneconomic loss. In the case of both this amount, and the 18 limits on noneconomic damages, the Supreme Court shall adjust the 19 amounts annually based on the Consumer Price Index.

The bill requires that, in any settled action, the plaintiff and defendant shall jointly file a copy of the settlement agreement with the appropriate professional board in the Division of Consumer Affairs within 30 days of the execution of the agreement. A provision prohibiting retaliation by a health care facility or agency against an employee who reports malpractice or acts as an expert witness in a malpractice action is also included.

27 The bill requires that medical malpractice liability insurers must offer groups of 50 or more physicians medical malpractice liability 28 29 insurance policies with a deductible in amounts of at least \$50,000 30 per occurrence and up to \$1,000,000 per occurrence. The 31 deductible amount may be treated as a self-insured retention, using 32 a third party administrator approved by the commissioner, or using 33 the medical malpractice liability insurer as a third party 34 administrator on an administrative-services-only basis. The bill 35 also requires that insurers offer deductibles to individual physicians 36 and practice groups, with a commensurate reduction in premium.

The bill also prohibits a medical malpractice liability insurer from increasing the premium of an insured for a medical malpractice liability claim unless that claim results in a medical malpractice claim settlement, judgment or arbitration award against the insured.

The statute of limitations for medical malpractice actions under current law is two years. However, under the discovery rule, the statute is tolled and does not begin to run until the plaintiff knew or, through the exercise of reasonable due diligence should have known, of the injury. The result of this rule is that the tail for medical malpractice liability actions can be virtually infinite.

48 The bill creates two separate statutes of limitations, both of

#### 20

which must be satisfied if a plaintiff is to timely file a medical 1 2 malpractice action. The action must be brought within one year 3 after the injured party first suffered appreciable harm and suspected, 4 or a reasonable person would have suspected, that someone had 5 done something wrong. The bill also provides that no action may 6 be brought more than three years after the plaintiff first suffered 7 appreciable harm. Either period can be tolled by fraud, intentional 8 concealment or the presence of a foreign object in the patient's 9 body. However, if the injured party was less than two years old 10 when appreciable harm was first suffered, the action must be 11 brought within seven years after the harm. In addition to the other 12 reasons the provisions of the bill may be tolled, the minor's 13 limitations period is tolled if the parent or guardian and the health 14 care provider or malpractice insurer have committed fraud or 15 collusion.